**“Building a global Wales after Brexit: international perspectives on small nations and soft power”**

26th April 2018 | Principality Stadium | Cardiff

#WalesSoftPower

**Event note**

Welcoming delegates, Auriol Miller, IWA Director, reflected that the diverse experiences and expertise in the room, from Wales, the UK and beyond, would lead to a rich, informed discussion.

Sir Ciarán Devane, CEO, British Council, introduced the concept of soft power as “making good connections, so more good things are likely to happen than bad”. He emphasised the power of example, through which countries learn from what others are doing, build relationships and are compelled to take action. Sir Devane emphasised the value of nuanced relationships at different levels of a nation’s structures, and the importance of recognising the potential of “softer” relations.

Carwyn Jones, First Minister for Wales, started with a football analogy; acknowledging his unusual choice considering the venue. He recounted a recent news report in which Egypt’s foreign minister described footballer Mo Salah as a source of national pride and happiness, indicative of the foreign minister’s recognition that soft power is a recognisable resource to be discussed and celebrated.

Mr Jones argued that, particularly in a period of continued austerity in public spending, reaching out to the world to generate economic improvement has never been more important and that Wales needs to be more “bolshy” in its pursuit of these links. He pointed to Qatar Airline’s investment in Cardiff Airport and the Aston Martin factory in the Vale of Glamorgan as examples of Wales’ ambition being realised, crediting the personal relationships built over time by people getting out from behind their desks and “selling Wales” as the catalyst for securing these investments.

Returning to football, Mr Jones argued “All the money in the world could not have achieved the same impact as our football team in the Euros 2016 - it cannot be bought, and we have to make the most of it”. He reflected that everyone in Wales is a potential ambassador, and when they travel they take the name and reputation of Wales with them. He spoke about the importance of making the case for having the right infrastructure to host major events, through which Wales has hosted the Ryder Cup, Rugby World Cup, Champions League Final and the NATO Summit in recent years.

Mr Jones reflected that Wales has things to learn, but a lot to offer as well. He pointed to internationally recognised policies such as presumed consent for organ donation, a levy on plastic bags, the Well-being of Future Generations and the Violence against Women Acts as examples of where Wales has led the way and other countries have taken note. He argued that soft power doesn’t rely on being the best - it relies on being “good in all senses of the word and creating a good country in which to do business”.

Following on, Jonathan McClory, author of [Wales Soft Power Barometer 2018](https://wales.britishcouncil.org/sites/default/files/wales_soft_power_barometer_2018_0.pdf), reflected that, to date, much of his research has focused on nation states, and he was excited to be able to consider what he described as the “much needed” implications of soft power at a sub-national level. Mr McClory expanded the definition of soft power to include “attraction and persuasion” and it being generated through “culture, public diplomacy, and a positive global contribution”. He set out Joseph Nye’s three pillars of soft power as political values, culture and foreign policy. He reflected that sub-national governments such as Wales can operate internationally without some of the political baggage associated with national governments and their foreign policy choices.

Introducing his research, Mr McClory used objective and subjective data to compare Wales with 9 other similar “regions” which were judged to be broadly comparable across factors including level of devolved authority, GDP, population size and history of international engagement amongst others. He acknowledged that using the term ‘region’ was problematic, emphasising that it was done for the purpose of comparing data. Overall Wales came 6th out of the 10 regions examined. Mr McClory was keen to emphasise that Wales starts from a decent base, and has strengths to leverage, particularly in digital and enterprise amongst the objective measures, and sport amongst the subjective polling data.

Mr McClory remarked upon his surprise at how Wales underperforms on perceived friendliness, at odds with his own experience and that of others. He noted that Wales did less well generally on the subjective polling data generally, earning a ranking of 7th out of 10. Mr McClory pointed to two potential reasons for this: “fragmented associations”, such as rugby and the royal family, as opposed to the clusters shown for other regions; and no clear distinction between Wales and the rest of the UK. He suggested this may mean international opinions on Wales are largely unformed, and this may provide an opportunity should Wales seize it.

Reflecting on the results, Mr McClory set out a number of recommendations for Wales to consider, including a tourism campaign to international visitors that focuses on Welsh people and their welcome rather than on castles and landscapes. He pointed to actions to attract more international students, take advantage of Wales’ presence at the 2019 Rugby World Cup in Japan, and leverage the Welsh language as a key differentiator for Wales from the rest of the UK. He also called on the Welsh Government to overhaul their approach to international affairs, suggesting a dedicated directorate and a ministerial portfolio would give Wales’ place in the world some much needed focus.

The final session of the morning focused on why and how small nations, regions and cities develop and deploy their soft power resources. Kicking off the discussion, Michel Lafleur, Assistant Deputy Minister, Bilateral Affairs, Québec Ministry for International Relations, reflected that Québec is a multilingual population but a minority in the context of Canada and North America more broadly. He noted that culture, education and French language were key aspects of Québec’s [**international policy**](http://www.mrif.gouv.qc.ca/en/ministere/politique-internationale)which was the result of a concerted government approach. He set out how Québec uses the features of the region that are distinct to drive international activities, for instance through engagement with *Organisation Internationale de la Francophonie* they have contributed to activities to fight climate change in Africa.

Professor Gary Rawnsley, Professor of Public Diplomacy, Aberystwyth University, expanded the definition of soft power to include how Governments behave, and are perceived to behave, towards their own citizens as well as towards citizens of other countries. He considered that Wales has significant soft power capacity in this area, and can point to progressive domestic policy, but less ability to communicate and project these political values to an international audience. Professor Rawnsley also cautioned against believing the soft power message always has to be positive, arguing that strong messages can come out of challenge. He suggested that the current Windrush scandal, whilst a challenging story for the current UK government, also showed that citizens voices are heard, parliament is working, and the UK media is free to scrutinise, all of which taken together add up to a positive message about a healthy British democracy.

Rebecca Matthews, CEO of Aarhus 2017 - European City of Culture, argued that it is important to galvanise the population behind soft power to ensure the message is important to people and so further amplified. She pointed to a broad consultation process in Aarhus which resulted in values important to Danish people, including sustainability and democracy, becoming the foundational premise for the year’s cultural programme. She commented on galvanised civic pride and engagement in the City as being as important as a 20% increase in tourism of the year and a 50% increase in international visitors.

Professor JP Singh, Professor of Culture and Political Economy & Director, Centre for Cultural Relations, University of Edinburgh, argued that soft power is as much about historic values and ethics, as what is happening in the present day. He posited that for nations that have a pluralistic media, few human rights restrictions and a strong democratic history, attracting international students and investment is easier. He reflected that national ethics, and what you stand for as a people, is both important and what is remembered. When asked by a member of the audience whether the narrative upon which soft power is built is more important that actual assets, Professor Singh responded that a story has to be based in facts in order to travel widely.   
  
A question from the audience asked whether a perceived struggle between Welsh speaking Wales and English speaking Wales could be seen to detract from our soft power? Professor Rawnsley argued that rather than detracting, the bilingual nature of Wales is a feature that can enrich our soft power, and one which we should be proudly communicating. Responding to a later question about misconceptions of Wales, Rebecca Matthews pointed to a values based approach to soft power as a positive basis for exchange, pointing to her experience in Aarhus in which collective behaviour, work-life balance and therapeutic architecture were recognised and celebrated. Ms Matthews reflected that as well as public engagement, it is important to involve the private sectors at the ideas stage and ensure they are a part of, and willing to commit to and fund, placemaking.

Introducing the first panel for the afternoon, Carole Green, Brexit Correspondent, ITV Cymru Wales, explained the discussion would now turn to the “What”: what does Wales have in terms of soft power?

Opening the discussion, Roger Lewis, Chairman of Cardiff Airport, observed he was speaking to a room full of people who are already converted to the potential of soft power, and the challenge ahead is to get this message across to those who aren’t. Mr Lewis pointed to the importance of infrastructure to support soft power activities, such as the Principality Stadium and Wales Millennium Centre, and the need to ensure these assets are shared around Wales. Mr Lewis also championed the importance of recognising what we already have, and “auditing our success”. He pointed to Whitchurch High School in Cardiff, where sporting stars and significant ambassadors for Wales Gareth Bale and Sam Warburton were both pupils, as an education institution we should understand and replicate.

Building on Mr Lewis’ reflections, Sophie Howe, Future Generations Commissioner for Wales, argued that we often measure the wrong things and that the softer factors which likely created Gareth Bale or Sam Warburton would not be picked up by an “audit” exercise. Ms Howe reflected that Wales has moved past narrow measures of progress to consider softer measures such as well-being. She was keen to emphasise that the Welsh definition of well-being includes cultural well-being as well as social, economic and environmental factors. Ms Howe argued that increasingly “liveability” factors, softer factors such as travel to work time and access to green space, are the things that are making communities, towns, cities and nations attractive places to live and to visit.

Kully Thiarai, Artistic Director, National Theatre Wales, began by reflecting upon a line in the [Wales Soft Power Barometer 2018](https://wales.britishcouncil.org/sites/default/files/wales_soft_power_barometer_2018_0.pdf) report, “attraction and persuasion is at the heart of soft power”, arguing that this is what the performing arts do on a daily basis. Attraction and persuasion are at the heart of conversation and telling stories, but it matters who is telling the story and behalf of whom, particularly in the context of Wales’ complex history and present, she cautioned. Ms Thiarai argued that any exchange which makes someone feel something positive about Wales is as important as institutions or buildings, and we must be careful not to underestimate the power of culture when constructing our idea of Wales’ soft power.

Professor Iwan Davies, Senior Pro-Vice Chancellor, Swansea University and Chair, Global Wales, set out his stall as “Talent, and the role of education in promoting that talent”. He argued “Universities represent the most successful experiment in global institution making”, and should be seen as significant soft power assets which can help build institutional links. He argued that research gives us credibility and a stake in helping solve global challenges, and provide a platform from which to reach out.

Kully Thiarai returned to the morning’s discussions to reflect on learning from Aarhus, and raised the notion of risk which is inherent in being bold, radical and revolutionary. “We need to jump in without necessarily knowing what is going to work”. Carole Green, Chair, reflected that the Wales Soft Power Barometer report shows Wales is seen as being entrepreneurial, and so a key challenge may be to examine what we can learn from an entrepreneurial approach to risk.

The final panel of the day turned to exploring how small nations, regions and cities can use their soft power capital to strengthen global engagement. Sara Pepper, Director of Creative Economy, Cardiff University, and chair of the session, reflected on a recent trip she took to Thailand to share Cardiff’s experience of setting up creative hubs. She gave the Minister of Commerce a Welsh lovespoon as a token of friendship. Two weeks ago a Thai delegation visited Cardiff, as part of a UK visit, and the Bangkok Post ran an article [Cardiff offers Creative Vision for Cardiff](https://www.bangkokpost.com/business/news/1450711/cardiff-offers-creative-vision-for-commerce). Ms Pepper explained that she told this story as an illustration of how powerful a force Wales can be if everyone steps up and shares a piece of our story when the opportunity arises.

Geraint Talfan Davies, former Chair, Welsh National Opera, observed that the day’s discussion felt “frighteningly familiar”, and pointed to a number of previous efforts including an IWA project in 1999 to set up a Global Wales platform, a Welsh Government Culture Strategy in 2004 and his own report [Single Market of the Mind](http://www.iwa.wales/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/20170315-IWA_SingleMarketoftheMind.pdf) (2017). He argued nothing will change if External Affairs continues to be a brief on the sides of the First Minister’s time, and endorsed the call for a clear focus within Government. Mr Talfan-Davies also urged Wales to use the Welsh language as an asset, to leverage our skills and expertise on bilingualism to share with other nations.

Shona McCarthy, Chief Executive, Edinburgh Festival Fringe Society, asked what would happen if we supported and utilized culture all the time, rather than just “turned to it in times of desperation?” She pointed to her experience in Edinburgh as a city in which “everyone gets it”, at political level, a policy level and in practice, and the sum of those parts has led to the success of the festival.   
  
Shain Shapiro, CEO, Sound Diplomacy, argued that culture, particularly music, offers significant opportunities to communicate across boundaries and allows us to reach new audiences. He argued that there are advantages to being a small nation in that you can act deliberately: Wales has existing cultural capital, and must ensure cultural infrastructure is protected.

Mr Nic Van der Marliere, Representative of the Government of Flanders in London, reflected that the Belgian circumstances are quite different in that Belgian regions have more power and money than the central state. He shared three pieces of advice for Wales. Firstly, grab power: to do foreign policy you need to be entitled to do so by the constitution. Secondly, have a brand to sell: get people on board, and do not underestimate that unless the population is behind you, you are talking to the convinced and the elite. Thirdly, share your story with empathy: don’t think only of how you want to promote it, think about what your partner is interested in.

Closing the day, Jenny Scott, Director, British Council Wales, thanked the speakers and audience for an informed, enthusiastic discussion. She remarked on the overriding sense that Wales has substantial soft power assets at its disposal, but work to do to realise its potential. She urged the conversation to continue, and shared news of the British Council Wales / Cymru initiative *Imagining Wales Global Future*. The initiative will commission further research, convene discussions and seek to connect people to drive forward a renewed push for Wales to realise and exercise its place in a global world. She invited anyone with an interest in this area to get in touch with the British Council Wales / Cymru.

**Networking break sponsored by:**



**“Adeiladu Cymru fyd-eang ar ôl Brexit: safbwyntiau rhyngwladol ar genhedloedd bach a grym cymell tawel”**

26 Ebrill 2018 | Stadiwm Principality | Caerdydd

#WalesSoftPower

**Nodyn o’r digwyddiad**

Croesawyd pawb i’r digwyddiad gan Auriol Miller, Cyfarwyddwr y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig, a nododd y byddai’r amrywiaeth o brofiadau ac arbenigedd yn yr ystafell, o Gymru, gwledydd Prydain a’r tu hwnt, yn arwain at drafodaeth gyfoethog a gwybodus.

Rhoddodd Syr Ciarán Devane, Prif Weithredwr y British Council, esboniad o rym cymell tawel fel “gwneud cysylltiadau da, fel bod mwy o bethau da na phethau gwael yn debygol o ddigwydd”. Roedd yn pwysleisio grym esiampl, sy’n golygu bod gwledydd yn dysgu o’r hyn mae eraill yn ei wneud, yn meithrin perthnasau ac yn cael eu cymell i weithredu. Pwysleisiodd Syr Ciarán werth perthnasau cynnil ar wahanol lefelau o strwythurau gwlad, a phwysigrwydd cydnabod potensial perthnasau “tawelach”.

Dechreuodd y Prif Weinidog Carwyn Jones gydag enghraifft o’r byd pêl-droed; gan gydnabod ei fod yn ddewis annisgwyl o ystyried eu lleoliad. Soniodd am adroddiad newyddion diweddar lle disgrifiwyd Mo Salah gan weinidog tramor yr Aifft fel testun llawenydd a balchder cenedlaethol, gan ddangos cydnabyddiaeth y gweinidog tramor bod cyfalaf cymell tawel yn adnodd sylweddol i’w drafod a’i ddathlu.

Roedd y Prif Weinidog yn dadlau, yn arbennig mewn cyfnod o lymder parhaus o ran gwariant cyhoeddus, bod ymestyn allan i’r byd er mwyn sicrhau gwelliant economaidd yn bwysicach nag erioed, a bod angen i Gymru fod yn fwy “beiddgar” wrth fynd ar ôl y cysylltiadau hyn. Tynnodd sylw at fuddsoddiad cwmni awyrennau Qatar Airways ym Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd a’r ffatri Aston Martin ym Mro Morgannwg fel enghreifftiau o wireddu uchelgais Cymru, gan roi clod i’r perthnasau personol a gafodd eu meithrin dros gyfnod wrth i bobl godi o’r tu ôl i’w desgiau a “gwerthu Cymru” fel catalydd ar gyfer sicrhau’r buddsoddiadau hyn.

Dychwelodd i fyd pêl-droed, gan ddadlau “Fyddai’r holl arian yn y byd ddim wedi gallu prynu’r effaith gafodd ein tîm pêl-droed cenedlaethol yn Ewros 2016 – does dim modd ei brynu, ac mae’n rhaid i ni wneud y gorau ohono”. Awgrymodd fod pawb yng Nghymru yn llysgennad posib, a’u bod yn mynd ag enw Cymru a’i henw da gyda nhw wrth deithio. Soniodd am bwysigrwydd gwneud yr achos dros gael seilwaith priodol i gynnal digwyddiadau o bwys, sydd wedi arwain at gynnal Cwpan Ryder, Cwpan Rygbi’r Byd, Rownd Derfynol Cynghrair y Pencampwyr ac Uwchgynhadledd Nato yma yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Nododd y Prif Weinidog fod gan Gymru bethau i’w dysgu, ond llawer i’w gynnig hefyd. Tynnodd sylw at bolisïau sy’n cael eu cydnabod yn rhyngwladol, fel cydsyniad tybiedig ar gyfer rhoi organau, ardoll ar fagiau plastig, Deddf Llesiant Cenedlaethau’r Dyfodol a’r Ddeddf Trais yn erbyn Menywod fel enghreifftiau lle mae Cymru wedi arwain y ffordd a lle mae gwledydd eraill wedi cymryd sylw. Dadleuodd nad yw cymell tawel yn dibynnu ar fod yn well na gwledydd eraill – mae’n dibynnu ar fod “yn dda yn holl ystyron y gair a chreu gwlad dda i wneud busnes ynddi”.

Yn nes ymlaen, nododd Jonathan McClory, awdur [Baromedr Cymell Tawel Cymru 2018](https://wales.britishcouncil.org/sites/default/files/baromedr_cymell_tawel_cymru_2018.pdf), fod llawer o’i ymchwil hyd yma wedi canolbwyntio ar genedl-wladwriaethau, a’i fod yn falch iawn o gael cyfle i ystyried goblygiadau “hanfodol bwysig” grym cymell tawel ar lefel is-wladwriaeth. Ehangodd Mr McClory ddiffiniad grym cymell tawel i gynnwys “denu a pherswadio” a’r ffaith ei fod yn cael ei greu drwy “ddiwylliant, diplomyddiaeth gyhoeddus a chyfraniad cadarnhaol i’r byd”. Amlinellodd dair colofn cymell tawel Joseph Nye, sef gwerthoedd gwleidyddol, diwylliant a pholisi tramor. Soniodd y gall llywodraethau is-wladwriaeth fel Cymru weithredu’n rhyngwladol heb gymaint o’r baich gwleidyddol sy’n gysylltiedig â llywodraeth gwladwriaethau a’u dewisiadau polisi tramor.

Wrth gyflwyno ei ymchwil, defnyddiodd Mr McClory ddata gwrthrychol a goddrychol i gymharu Cymru â naw “rhanbarth” arall tebyg yr oedd modd eu cymharu’n gyffredinol ar sail sawl ffactor gan gynnwys lefel yr awdurdod datganoledig, cynnyrch domestig gros, maint y boblogaeth a’u hanes o ymgysylltu rhyngwladol, ymhlith eraill. Roedd yn cydnabod bod y term ‘rhanbarth’ yn broblematig, gan bwysleisio mai er mwyn cymharu data yr oedd hynny. Ar y cyfan, daeth Cymru’n chweched o blith y deg rhanbarth a astudiwyd. Roedd Mr McClory yn pwysleisio bod Cymru’n cychwyn o sylfaen digon parchus, a bod ganddi gryfderau i’w defnyddio, yn enwedig ym maes menter a’r byd digidol ymhlith y mesurau gwrthrychol, a chwaraeon wrth edrych ar ddata goddrychol yr arolwg.

Nododd Mr McClory ei syndod bod Cymru’n tanberfformio o ran canfyddiad pobl o’n cyfeillgarwch, oedd yn groes i’w brofiad ei hunan a phrofiad eraill. Nododd fod Cymru’n gwneud yn waeth yn gyffredinol wrth edrych ar ddata goddrychol yr arolwg, gan ddod yn seithfed allan o ddeg. Nododd Mr McClory ddau reswm posib am hynny: “syniadau tameidiog” am Gymru, fel rygbi a’r teulu brenhinol, o gymharu â’r clystyrau cliriach a welwyd mewn rhanbarthau eraill; a diffyg gwahaniaethu rhwng Cymru a gweddill Prydain. Awgrymodd y gallai hynny olygu bod barn ryngwladol am Gymru yn anaeddfed i raddau helaeth, ac y gallai hyn fod yn gyfle petai Cymru’n dewis achub ar y cyfle hwnnw.

Wrth ystyried y canlyniadau, nododd Mr McClory sawl argymhelliad i Gymru eu hystyried, gan gynnwys ymgyrch dwristiaeth i ymwelwyr rhyngwladol sy’n canolbwyntio ar bobl Cymru a’u croeso cynnes yn hytrach na chestyll a thirluniau. Tynnodd sylw at gamau er mwyn denu rhagor o fyfyrwyr rhyngwladol, manteisio ar bresenoldeb Cymru yng Nghwpan Rygbi’r Byd yn Siapan, a defnyddio’r iaith fel rhywbeth allweddol i dynnu gwahaniaeth rhwng Cymru a gweddill Prydain. Galwodd hefyd ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ailystyried eu hagwedd o ran materion rhyngwladol, gan awgrymu y byddai cyfarwyddiaeth benodedig a phortffolio gweinidogol yn rhoi’r sylw oedd ei angen i le Cymru yn y byd.

Roedd sesiwn ola’r bore yn canolbwyntio ar sut a pham mae dinasoedd, rhanbarthau a gwledydd bach yn datblygu ac yn defnyddio eu hadnoddau cymell tawel. Gan gychwyn y drafodaeth, esboniodd Michel Lafleur, Dirprwy Weinidog Cynorthwyol dros Faterion Dwyochrog yng Ngweinyddiaeth Cysylltiadau Rhyngwladol Québec, fod poblogaeth Québec yn un amlieithog, ond ei bod yn lleiafrif yng nghyd-destun ehangach Canada a Gogledd America. Nododd fod diwylliant, addysg a’r Ffrangeg yn elfennau allweddol o **bolisi rhyngwladol** Québec, o ganlyniad i gyd-ymdrech gan y llywodraeth. Nododd sut mae Québec yn defnyddio nodweddion unigryw’r rhanbarth er mwyn gyrru gweithgareddau rhyngwladol: er enghraifft, drwy ymwneud ag *Organisation Internationale de la Francophonie* maen nhw wedi cyfrannu at weithgareddau i frwydro yn erbyn newid hinsawdd yn Affrica.

Aeth yr Athro Gary Rawnsley, Athro Diplomyddiaeth Gyhoeddus ym Mhrifysgol Aberystwyth ati i ehangu’r diffiniad o rym cymell tawel i gynnwys sut mae llywodraethau’n ymddwyn, a sut mae pobl yn meddwl maen nhw’n ymddwyn, tuag at eu dinasyddion eu hunain yn ogystal â thuag at ddinasyddion gwledydd eraill. Roedd o’r farn bod gan Gymru gapasiti cymell tawel sylweddol yn y maes hwn, a bod modd tynnu sylw at bolisi domestig blaengar, ond bod gennym lai o allu i gyfleu a thaflunio’r gwerthoedd hyn i gynulleidfa ryngwladol. Rhybuddiodd yr Athro Rawnsley hefyd yn erbyn credu bod rhaid i neges cymell tawel fod yn gadarnhaol bob amser, gan ddadlau bod her yn gallu arwain at negeseuon cryfion hefyd. Awgrymodd fod sgandal bresennol Windrush, er ei bod yn stori heriol i lywodraeth bresennol Prydain, hefyd yn dangos bod lleisiau dinasyddion yn cael eu clywed, bod y senedd yn gweithio a bod cyfryngau Prydain yn rhydd i graffu, ac awgrymodd fod hyn i gyd, gyda’i gilydd, yn creu neges gadarnhaol bod gan Brydain ddemocratiaeth iach.

Dadleuodd Rebecca Matthews, Prif Weithredwr Aarhus 2017 – Dinas Diwylliant Ewrop, ei bod yn bwysig ysgogi’r boblogaeth i gefnogi ymdrechion cymell tawel er mwyn sicrhau bod y neges yn bwysig i bobl a’i bod felly’n cael ei chwyddo ymhellach. Tynnodd sylw at broses ymgynghori eang yn Aarhus a arweiniodd at wneud gwerthoedd sy’n bwysig i bobl Denmarc, gan gynnwys cynaliadwyedd a democratiaeth, yn sylfaen ar gyfer rhaglen ddiwylliannol y flwyddyn. Nododd fod y balchder dinesig a’r ymgysylltiad a ysgogwyd yn y ddinas wedi bod yn bwysig o ran sicrhau cynnydd o 20% mewn twristiaeth yn ystod y flwyddyn, a chynnydd o 50% yn nifer yr ymwelwyr rhyngwladol.

Dadleuodd yr Athro JP Singh, Athro Diwylliant ac Economi Wleidyddol a Chyfarwyddwr Canolfan Cysylltiadau Diwylliannol Prifysgol Caeredin, fod grym cymell tawel yn ymwneud yn gymaint â moeseg a gwerthoedd hanesyddol â’r hyn sy’n digwydd heddiw. Os oes gan wledydd gyfryngau lluosog, llai o gyfyngiadau ar hawliau dynol a hanes democrataidd cryf, mae denu buddsoddiad a myfyrwyr rhyngwladol yn haws, meddai. Nododd mai moeseg genedlaethol, a’r hyn rydych yn sefyll drosto fel pobl, yw’r hyn sy’n bwysig a’r hyn sy’n cael ei gofio. Pan ofynnwyd iddo gan aelod o’r gynulleidfa a yw’r naratif sy’n sylfaen i rym cymell tawel yn bwysicach nag asedau gwirioneddol, atebodd yr Athro Singh fod rhaid seilio stori ar ffeithiau er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn teithio.

Holwyd o’r gynulleidfa a allai brwydr dybiedig rhwng y Gymru Gymraeg a’r Gymru Saesneg dynnu oddi ar ein grym cymell tawel? Dadleuodd yr Athro Rawnsley nad rhwystr yw dwyieithrwydd Cymru, ond nodwedd gadarnhaol a all ychwanegu at ein grym cymell tawel, ac y dylem fod yn falch o’i rhannu â’r byd. Wrth ymateb i gwestiwn diweddarach ynghylch camdybiaethau am Gymru, tynnodd Rebecca Matthews sylw at feddylfryd cymell tawel sy’n seiliedig ar werthoedd fel sail gadarnhaol ar gyfer cyfnewid, gan sôn am ei phrofiad ei hunan yn Aarhus lle cai ymddygiad grŵp, cydbwysedd bywyd a gwaith a phensaernïaeth therapiwtig eu cydnabod a’u dathlu. Soniodd Ms Matthews fod ymgysylltu cyhoeddus yn bwysig, ond ei bod hefyd yn bwysig cynnwys y sectorau preifat yn ystod y cyfnod syniadau a sicrhau eu bod yn rhan o’r gwaith llunio lle, a sicrhau eu bod yn fodlon ymrwymo i’r gwaith hwnnw a’i ariannu.

Wrth gyflwyno panel cynta’r prynhawn, esboniodd Carole Green, Gohebydd Brexit ITV Cymru, y byddai’r drafodaeth nawr yn troi ar y “Beth?”: beth sydd gan Gymru i’w gynnig o ran grym cymell tawel?

Agorwyd y drafodaeth gan Roger Lewis, Cadeirydd Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd, a sylwodd ei fod yn siarad gyda llond ystafell o bobl oedd wedi cael eu darbwyllo ynghylch potensial cymell tawel, ac mai’r frwydr o’u blaenau fyddai cyfleu’r neges hon i bobl sydd heb eu darbwyllo eto. Soniodd am bwysigrwydd seilwaith i gefnogi gweithgareddau cymell tawel, seilwaith fel Stadiwm Principality a Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru, a phwysigrwydd sicrhau bod yr asedau hyn yn cael eu rhannu o gwmpas Cymru. Roedd hefyd yn credu bod rhaid cydnabod yr hyn sydd gennym eisoes, a chynnal “archwiliad o’n llwyddiant”. Tynnodd sylw at Ysgol Uwchradd yr Eglwys Newydd yng Nghaerdydd, lle bu’r sêr chwaraeon a dau lysgennad gwych i Gymru, Gareth Bale a Sam Warburton, yn ddisgyblion, gan ddweud ei fod yn sefydliad addysg y dylem geisio ei ddeall a’i ddyblygu.

Gan adeiladu ar sylwadau Roger Lewis, dadleuodd Sophie Howe, Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau’r Dyfodol, ein bod yn mesur y pethau anghywir yn aml, a bod y ffactorau tawelach a oedd yn debygol o fod wedi creu Gareth Bale a Sam Warburton yn annhebygol o gael eu hadnabod mewn ymarferiad “archwilio”. Credai Ms Howe fod Cymru wedi symud y tu hwnt i fesurau cul o gynnydd, a’n bod bellach yn ystyried mesurau tawelach hefyd, fel llesiant. Roedd hi’n awyddus i bwysleisio bod diffiniad Cymru o lesiant yn cynnwys llesiant diwylliannol yn ogystal â ffactorau cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol. Dadleuai Ms Howe mai ffactorau tawelach yn ymwneud â pha mor dda yw rhywle i fyw, amser teithio i’r gwaith a mynediad at ofod gwyrdd yw’r pethau sy’n gwneud cymunedau, trefi, dinasoedd a gwledydd yn llefydd deniadol i fyw ac ymweld â nhw.

Dechreuodd Kully Thiarai, Cyfarwyddwr Artistig National Theatre Wales, drwy fyfyrio ar linell yn adroddiad [Baromedr Cymell Tawel Cymru 2018](https://wales.britishcouncil.org/sites/default/files/baromedr_cymell_tawel_cymru_2018.pdf) oedd yn dweud bod denu a pherswadio yn ganolog i rym cymell tawel. Roedd yn dadlau bod y celfyddydau perfformio yn gwneud hyn bob dydd. Mae denu a pherswadio yn ganolog i gynnal sgwrs ac adrodd stori, ond mae’n bwysig ystyried pwy sy’n dweud y stori ac ar ran pwy, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun cymhleth hanes Cymru a’i phresennol, rhybuddiodd. Dadleuodd Ms Thiarai fod unrhyw gyfnewid sy’n gwneud i rywun deimlo rhywbeth cadarnhaol am Gymru yr un mor bwysig â sefydliadau neu adeiladau, ac y dylem fod yn ofalus rhag tanbrisio grym diwylliant wrth lunio ein syniad o rym cymell tawel Cymru.

Penderfynodd yr Athro Iwan Davies, Uwch Ddirprwy Is-Ganghellor Prifysgol Abertawe a Chadeirydd Cymru Fyd-eang, amlinellu ei weledigaeth fel “Doniau, a swyddogaeth addysg yn hybu’r doniau hynny”. Dadleuai mai “prifysgolion yw’r arbrawf mwyaf llwyddiannus eto o ran creu sefydliadau byd-eang”, ac y dylid eu gweld fel asedau grym cymell tawel sylweddol a all helpu i greu cysylltiadau sefydliadol. Dadleuai fod ymchwil yn rhoi hygrededd i ni, a rhan yn y gwaith o helpu i ddatrys heriau byd-eang, ac yn darparu llwyfan ar gyfer ymestyn allan i’r byd.

Aeth Kully Thiarai yn ôl at drafodaethau’r bore i fyfyrio ar yr hyn y gellid ei ddysgu o Aarhus, a chyfeiriodd at yr elfen o risg sy’n rhan gynhenid o fod yn ddewr, yn radical ac yn chwyldroadol. “Mae angen i ni neidio i mewn heb wybod o reidrwydd beth fydd yn gweithio”. Awgrymodd y Cadeirydd Carole Green fod Baromedr Cymell Tawel Cymru yn dangos bod delwedd entrepreneuraidd gan Gymru, ac felly mai un her allweddol fyddai astudio beth y gallwn ei ddysgu drwy fod yn entrepreneuraidd ynghylch risg.

Trodd panel ola’r dydd i edrych ar y ffordd y gall dinasoedd, rhanbarthau a gwledydd bach ddefnyddio eu cyfalaf cymell tawel i gryfhau gwaith ymgysylltu byd-eang. Soniodd Sara Pepper, Cyfarwyddwr Economi Greadigol ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd, oedd yn cadeirio’r sesiwn, am ei thaith ddiweddar i Wlad Thai i rannu profiad Caerdydd o sefydlu hybiau creadigol. Rhoddodd lwy garu yn anrheg i’r Gweinidog Masnach fel arwydd o gyfeillgarwch. Bythefnos yn ôl, bu dirprwyaeth o Wlad Thai ar ymweliad â Chaerdydd, fel rhan o ymweliad â gwledydd Prydain, ac fe gyhoeddodd y Bangkok Post erthygl [Cardiff offers Creative Vision for Commerce](https://www.bangkokpost.com/business/news/1450711/cardiff-offers-creative-vision-for-commerce). Esboniodd Ms Pepper ei bod yn adrodd y stori hon i ddangos mor rymus y gall Cymru fod os bydd pawb yn camu i’r adwy ac yn rhannu darn o stori ein gwlad pan fydd cyfle’n codi.

Nododd Geraint Talfan Davies, cyn Gadeirydd Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, fod trafodaethau’r dydd “yn frawychus o gyfarwydd”, a thynnodd sylw at nifer o ymdrechion blaenorol gan gynnwys prosiect gan y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig yn 1999 i sefydlu llwyfan Cymru Fyd-eang, Strategaeth Ddiwylliant gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn 2004 a’i adroddiad ef ei hunan, [Single Market of the Mind](http://www.iwa.wales/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/20170315-IWA_SingleMarketoftheMind.pdf) (2017). Dadleuodd na fydd dim yn newid os bydd Materion Allanol yn parhau i fod yn ddim mwy na briff ymylol yng ngwaith y Prif Weinidog, a chefnogodd yr alwad am ffocws clir o fewn y Llywodraeth. Galwodd ar Gymru hefyd i ddefnyddio’r Gymraeg fel ased, ac i ddefnyddio ein sgiliau a’n harbenigedd ar ddwyieithrwydd a’u rhannu gyda gwledydd eraill.

Gofynnodd Shona McCarthy, Prif Weithredwr Cymdeithas Gŵyl yr Ymylon Caeredin, beth fyddai’n digwydd petaen ni’n cefnogi ac yn defnyddio diwylliant drwy’r amser, yn hytrach na “dim ond troi ato ar adegau argyfyngus?” Soniodd am ei phrofiad yng Nghaeredin fel dinas lle mae “pawb yn ei deall hi”, ar lefel wleidyddol, lefel polisi ac yn ymarferol, a nododd mai cyfanswm y rhannau hynny sydd wedi arwain at lwyddiant yr ŵyl.

Dadleuodd Shain Shapiro, Prif Weithredwr Sound Diplomacy, fod diwylliant, yn enwedig cerddoriaeth, yn cynnig cyfle sylweddol i gyfathrebu ar draws ffiniau a’u bod yn caniatáu i ni gyrraedd cynulleidfaoedd newydd. Dadleuai fod manteision o fod yn wlad fach gan y gallwch weithredu’n fwriadus: mae gan Gymru gyfalaf diwylliannol eisoes, a rhaid sicrhau bod y seilwaith diwylliannol yn cael ei ddiogelu.

Soniodd Mr Nic Van der Marliere, Cynrychiolydd Llywodraeth Fflandrys yn Llundain, fod yr amgylchiadau yng Ngwlad Belg yn wahanol iawn, gan fod gan ranbarthau Gwlad Belg fwy o rym ac arian na’r wladwriaeth ganolog. Rhannodd dri darn o gyngor gyda Chymru. Yn gyntaf, bachwch y grym: er mwyn llunio polisi tramor, mae angen i’r cyfansoddiad roi hawl i chi wneud hynny. Yn ail, gwnewch yn siŵr fod gennych frand i’w werthu: gwnewch yn siŵr fod y bobl yn eich cefnogi, ac os nad yw’r boblogaeth gyfan y tu ôl i chi, sylweddolwch mai dim ond gyda’r cadwedig a’r elît y byddwch yn siarad. Yn drydydd, rhannwch eich stori gydag empathi: meddyliwch am fwy na dim ond sut hoffech chi ei rhannu – meddyliwch beth sydd o ddiddordeb i’ch partner hefyd.

Wrth gloi’r diwrnod, rhoddodd Jenny Scott, Cyfarwyddwr British Council Cymru, air o ddiolch i’r siaradwyr a’r gynulleidfa am drafodaeth wybodus, frwd. Soniodd am yr ymdeimlad amlwg bod asedau cymell tawel sylweddol ar gael i Gymru, ond bod angen gwaith er mwyn gwireddu eu potensial. Galwodd ar bawb i gadw’r sgwrs i fynd, a rhannodd newyddion am fenter newydd gan British Council Cymru, *Dychmygu Dyfodol Byd-eang Cymru*. Bydd y fenter yn comisiynu ymchwil pellach, yn cynnull trafodaethau ac yn cysylltu pobl er mwyn bwrw ymlaen gydag ymdrech o’r newydd er mwyn i Gymru wireddu a chymryd ei lle yng nghyd-destun byd-eang yr oes. Gwahoddodd unrhyw un oedd â diddordeb yn y maes hwn i gysylltu â British Council Cymru.

**Noddwyd yr egwyl rhwydweithio gan:**

